

Biodiversity Challenge Funds Projects Darwin Initiative, Illegal Wildlife Trade Challenge Fund, and Darwin Plus Half Year Report

Note: If there is any confidential information within the report that you do not wish to be shared on our website, please ensure you clearly highlight this.

Submission Deadline: 31st October 2022

Project reference	IWT 107
Project title	Strengthening governance of legal wildlife trade to combat illegal trade
Country(ies)/territory(ies)	Indonesia
Lead partner	Yayasan IAR Indonesia
Partner(s)	KSDAE, Lancaster University (Jacob Phelps), ASLIQEWAN
Project leader	Karmele Llano Sanchez
Report date and number (e.g. HYR1)	<i>HYR2</i>
Project website/blog/social media	www.internationalanimalrescue.or.id

1. Outline progress over the last 6 months (April – Sept) against the agreed project implementation timetable (if your project has started less than 6 months ago, please report on the period since start up to end September).

We are reporting our progress in the past 6 months against the project activities for each of our four outputs:

Output 1: Wildlife trade regulatory system and zoonotic disease risk in animal markets and along the supply chain in Indonesia are well-understood.

1.1 Conduct situational analysis of legal wildlife trade and market governance systems in the two provinces including: a review of legislation, management structures, the regulatory system for managing legal trade (trade permits, harvest and export quotas, quarantine, breeding licences, frequency of inspections), and a systems dynamics approach (using Venism) to model and map the governance network structure.

The complex governance structure and hierarchy in the target markets have now been unravelled and documented. Almost all key market stakeholders have been identified and interviewed. Information gathered from these interviews along with the previous market assessments and the disease risk assessment has provided information towards the situational analysis. The review of the associated market legislation is nearing completion, as is the first draft of the Situational Analysis Report.

1.2 Carry out surveys by YIARI's experienced Wildlife Protection Unit field team of selected markets (n =4) in the two provinces for collection of trade data.

Assessments of the four target markets were completed in the first semester of this Project which provided the basis of the situational analysis and many of the baselines for monitoring and evaluation. Regular wildlife trade surveys of these markets (including the four target species) have continued on a monthly basis throughout this last period in order to assess trade dynamics and fluctuations.

1.4 Assessment of hunters (species harvested, volumes, permits and methods) and zoonotic disease risk through semi-structured interviews with members of two forest-edge communities (Sandai, West Kalimantan and Ciwidey, West Java) involved in the supply of wildlife to markets.

We conducted interviews with 12 wildlife hunters in West Kalimantan and 13 hunters in West Java. Data collected during the interviews included details on hunting methods, frequency, species hunted, and awareness and perceptions of the law and zoonotic risks. The interview recordings have been transcribed, translated, and the data have been analysed. This information may also feature in the situational analysis.

1.5 Zoonotic Disease Risk Assessment of Indonesian animal markets – desktop study including (Greatorex et al., 2016): 1. potential for wildlife and human contact; 2. potential for traded wildlife to carry a zoonotic pathogen; 3. opportunities for pathogen transmission from infected wildlife to humans or via intermediary species (based on observed biosafety practices or lack thereof in markets); 4. potential for human spread of a disease from markets to wider populations (based on market location and origin of market visitors); and 5. severity of the disease (pathogenicity, morbidity, mortality).

The Zoonotic Disease Risk Assessment (DRA) is underway. A list of all potential pathogens for each class of wildlife encountered during wildlife surveys at each of the markets has been completed. For each potential pathogen, the causative agents, routes of transmission, threat levels (based on different components such as the likelihood of contact, infection and transmission, as well as the impact on individual and population), critical control points and disease risk management strategies are being compiled and documented.

1.6 Develop a risk management plan to recommend potential preventive measures and protocols for animal markets.

The risk management plan is being developed as a subsection of the Disease Risk Analysis based on the key risks and critical control points identified.

Output 2: Development of a national One Health framework focused on the wildlife trade through top-down and bottom-up multi-stakeholders engagement and collaboration.

2.1 Establish a stakeholder working group including members of local governments, academic institutions, market vendors, wildlife traders and breeders, community members and NGOs to inform development of the strategy.

Engagement of key market stakeholders has been a lot more difficult than previously anticipated. Nevertheless, progress has now been made in contacting and engaging the stakeholders, but still on a one-to-one basis. Currently, very little coordination seems to occur between different agencies and divisions in the markets. The plan is to introduce representatives of these different agencies to each other during the FGDs and then formulate a working group. This will begin in November 2022.

A total of 22 market stakeholders from the animal husbandry, zoonosis screening, public health, infrastructure, and sanitation sectors have so far been identified in Jakarta (12 local stakeholders) and Bandung (10 stakeholders). These governmental agencies are responsible for overseeing, controlling, and monitoring different activities and sectors in three of our target markets. Interviews with these stakeholders have already been carried out and invitations to participate in the FGDs were submitted. A list of relevant stakeholders has been compiled for West Kalimantan and initial interviews will commence in November 2022.

2.2 Carry out a series of FGDs and webinars with the stakeholder working group to co-formulate the One Health strategy for Indonesian animal markets and along the wildlife trade chain.

The first FGD in Bandung will be held on November 2nd with the participation of 10 key agencies and departments (20 people) associated with the Sukahaji Market management and supervision. Introductory presentations will be held by YIARI and by the representatives of the

Veterinary Medicine Study Programme from the University of Padjadjaran. The subsequent FGD session will be highly interactive and encourage active participation from all participants.

The first FGD in East Jakarta will be on November 8th with the participation of 15 key agencies (30 people) related to the Jatinegara and Pramuka Markets management and supervision. Introductory presentations will be given by YIARI Team and representatives of East Jakarta Food, Marine and Agricultural Security Service (DKPKP). Participants will be divided into 2 or 3 groups to discuss and identify the roles of each stakeholder in Pramuka and Jatinegara market and their responsibilities to manage zoonotic disease transmission risks.

FGDs in West Kalimantan will begin in December once initial interviews have been completed.

2.3 Joint formulation of a national One Health framework for wildlife trade in cooperation with government partners.

A variety of public health risks and other issues associated with wildlife trade in the four target markets have already been identified through desk-based research, previous market assessments and through the ongoing Disease Risk Assessment. These risks will be raised during the FGDs with market stakeholders and discussed at length. Other potential risks will also be identified during the meetings. Practical, realistic and implementable solutions will be sought. The results and proceedings of the FGDs—starting in November—will be used as a basis for the drafting of the National One Health Framework.

Output 3: Improved capability, capacity and transparency amongst the two key government agencies responsible for the governance and enforcement of the wildlife markets regulations (KSDAE and GAKKUM under the Ministry of Environment and Forestry) to better regulate legal wildlife trade.

3.1 Hold two capacity building workshops (one in each province) for provincial-level agencies involved in animal market management and governance, such as Quarantine, Public Health Office (Dinas Kesehatan), Department of Animal Husbandry (Dinas Perternakan) and the Provincial Market Office (Dinas Pasar Provinsi) to increase capacity, motivation and integrity. Each workshop will be held for approx. 30 participants.

The capacity-building workshops will take place by the middle of Year 2. These will also provide an opportunity to socialise the results of the joint strategy. The workshops will include provincial and national level representatives from the same departments and agencies that we are currently working with at the local market level. Contact with some provincial-level agencies (KSDAE, KKH and Quarantine) has already been established and discussions regarding these workshops have begun.

3.2 Carry out six capacity building workshops for national level agencies (GAKKUM and KSDAE) – with 30 participants per session - to increase capacity of officers responsible for the management, regulation and enforcement of legal trade.

Capacity-building workshops are planned to happen towards the middle of Year 2. YIARI has maintained contact with both GAKKUM and KSDAE through regular collaborations involving our ongoing conservation work and efforts to reduce the illegal trade in Indonesia.

Output 4: The trial implementation of the one-health strategy at four markets in West Java (3) and West Kalimantan (1) and two forest-edge communities involved in the supply of wildlife.

4.1 Through the collaborative working group, use the national framework to co-formulate suitable, local pilot strategies for four priority markets (i.e. one in Pontianak, West Kalimantan, two in Jakarta and one in West Java) that will ensure long-term commitment from key stakeholders and serve to demonstrate how the framework can be operationalized at the local level.

The locally-appropriate strategies will be formulated during the series of FGDs in each of the target areas. This process will involve key stakeholders from the respective markets. The development process will be collaborative and interactive and will help to ensure that

implantable and sustainable interventions are chosen. This process will begin during the first FGDs in November 2022. During the interactive FGDs, a list of risks and issues associated with activities or situations in the markets that pose a threat to human and wildlife health will be produced. A list of interventions for each risk will be compiled and ordered in terms of priority and level of difficulty. The stakeholders will decide on which interventions will be feasible and implementable in their own markets.

4.2 Communication and engagement of traders in animal markets through a series of socialization activities at the four target animal markets involving different stakeholders.

Socialization with traders in the four target markets will begin after the compiling of a One Health strategy by market stakeholders. Initial contact with a number of traders was already established during the market assessments. Representatives from bird-keeping associations and breeders have also been asked to participate in the FGDs. Good relations will be maintained until the interventions in each market are ready to be undertaken.

4.3 Assist in the inspection and monitoring of the target animal markets, reassuring that trader and market staff comply with the strategy provisions, and there are appropriate responses from regulatory governmental agencies. This will be enabled by frequent presence in the target markets, continuous data collection and communications with traders and government.

Monitoring of key animal species traded in the four target markets has continued monthly by our survey team. Joint inspections along with local authorities will begin in the second year of this project.

4.4 Carry out community outreach and health education in the two target communities in collaboration with universities (e.g. One Health Collaborating Center – OHCC under INDOHUN) and local NGOs in the health sector (e.g. ASRI).

Outreach and health education in target forest-edge communities are planned to happen by the second semester of Year 2. Work collaborations with the Faculty of Medicine from the University of Padjadjaran have already been established who will be assisting with the socialisation events in West Java.

2. Give details of any notable problems or unexpected developments/lessons learnt that the project has encountered over the last 6 months. Explain what impact these could have on the project and whether the changes will affect the budget and timetable of project activities.

- Difficulties in contacting and engaging stakeholders from government agencies have resulted in some delays in project activities. For many years, various Indonesian and international conservation NGOs have criticised and attacked the government for its governance in the wildlife markets, particularly due to the large numbers of protected and threatened species on display. This has led to a reluctance by many government agencies to engage with conservation NGOs due to fear of further condemnation. This factor caused some setbacks early on in terms of our timeline. Approaching these agencies through academic institutes (our local university partners) and through our veterinary consultant's network has proved to be more neutral and effective in gaining initial contact. In Jakarta, an existing MoU with the Jakarta Nature Conservation Agency (BKSDA) to acquire permission to hold the FGDs with BKSDA as the leading sector. This meant that invitations for the workshops were sent by BKSDA.
- Furthermore, there are complex structures and hierarchies of government agencies and departments involved in the governance of the wildlife markets. Each market has a different management system, and sometimes roles and responsibilities of stakeholders were not clear. For each agency, finding suitable and sufficiently senior staff members in which to contact is required. Once initial contact has been made and the staff member has agreed to an interview, there was often a complicated and lengthy process of administration (permission letters and letters of intent). In some cases, there was a great deal of back and forth – and it became obvious that they were making excuses and hoping that we would give up. Persistence and patience were key to achieving

success. It appears, that many government staff are anxious about conducting interviews with external parties due to the current sensitive political situation in Indonesia with regard to freedom of speech.

- We also uncovered through our interviews that the Jatinegara market is an illegal market and is not under the governance of the government's market authority (*PD Pasar Jaya*). The land it is currently operating on is half owned by the Indonesian Railway (KAI) and half by the Indonesian Electric company (PLN) and therefore outside of the jurisdiction of *PD Pasar Jaya*. Jakarta's local government had previously suggested that the Jatinegara market should be relocated to another area, but this plan was not supported by traders and bird-keeping communities who said the proposed location was too far. It is uncertain why this market is allowed to operate despite its illegal status, but it seems that there is backing from other local entities. Jatinegara appears to be under the control of two *ormas* or community organisations (*Pemuda Pancasila and Forum Betawi Rempug*) with some links to organised crime. The complexity of the governance situation in Jatinegara meant that additional time was spent trying to identify the key stakeholders involved. We plan to uncover more details about this illegal aspect and try to confirm the involvement of the *ormas* during the FGDs with other stakeholders in November 2022.
- Moreover, due to two staff members have left the Project, and difficulties in finding a good replacement for Britha, there has been a delay in the completion of the Situational Analysis and the undertaking of the FGDs, as explained in the Change Request submitted in October. As the completion of these two activities is essential for the progression to subsequent phases of the project, we requested a 6-months extension of our grant period so that the goal of our Project would remain attainable.

3. Have any of these issues been discussed with NIRAS-LTS International and if so, have changes been made to the original agreement?

Discussed with NIRAS-LTS: Yes

Formal Change Request submitted: Yes

Received confirmation of change acceptance Yes

Change request reference if known:

4a. Do you currently expect to have any significant (e.g. more than £5,000) underspend in your budget for this year?

Yes No Estimated underspend: £

4b. If yes, then you need to consider your project budget needs carefully. Please remember that any funds agreed for this financial year are only available to the project in this financial year.

If you anticipate a significant underspend because of justifiable changes within the project, please submit a re-budget Change Request as soon as possible. There is no guarantee that Defra will agree a re-budget so please ensure you have enough time to make appropriate changes if necessary. Please DO NOT send these in the same email as your report.

5. Are there any other issues you wish to raise relating to the project or to BCF management, monitoring, or financial procedures?

N/A

If you are a new project and you received feedback comments that requested a response (including the submission of your risk register), or if your Annual Report Review asked you to provide a response with your next half year report, please attach your response to this document.

Please note: Any planned modifications to your project schedule/workplan can be discussed in this report but **should also be raised with NIRAS-LTS International through a Change Request. **Please DO NOT send these in the same email.****

Please send your **completed report by email** to BCF-Reports@niras.com. The report should be between 2-3 pages maximum. **Please state your project reference number, followed by the specific fund in the header of your email message e.g. Subject: 29-001 Darwin Initiative Half Year Report**